ATTUNING TO THE PAST WHILE AGING OUT OF CARE 
– A METASYNTHESIS

Ole Steen Kristensen
Department of Psychology and Behavioural Sciences, 
Aarhus University, Denmark

Abstract

The transition from care to independent life is difficult for former foster care youth. The experience of aging out of care may be troublesome and accentuate problems already experienced. The youth face a lot of setbacks and rejections during the transition, resulting in a high risk of unemployment and a low educational level. This is referred to as disappointing and/or an attainment gap. There is, however, still a lack of knowledge as to what creates these disappointing results and how the youth may overcome influences of their foster care history and their experiences while in care. Thesaurus, free-text terms and broad text terms formed the basis for a broad search. Systematic searches of PsycInfo and Social Science Citation Index were undertaken, and relevant studies were identified. Strict criteria were used and the studies were evaluated by using the “Framework for assessing qualitative evaluations”. The selected studies were coded in NVivo and the following themes were identified and described: First, the obstacles were identified: placement instability, negative experiences in care and school, stigma and lack of vocational guidance. Second, the transition may evoke ambivalent feelings and accentuate the experience of the past and of social ties. Third, the struggle for an independent life, dreams and aspirations are mixed with negative feelings and beliefs that may occupy their minds and turn the balance between thinking about the future and living in the moment towards the latter. Ambivalence and disruptions are more common than persistence and goal setting. The results could be useful in improving the transitional services in an attempt to help former foster care youth to deal with their troublesome foster care history.

Keywords: transition, leaving care, metasynthesis.

1 INTRODUCTION

The experience of aging out of care may be troublesome and makes it difficult for former foster youth to adjust to new demands and activities during the transition. Transitions are broadly defined as changes that an individual is faced with, and the individual will then need to organize activities in a new way [1]. For former foster youth this transition is accelerated [2], meaning that former foster care youth have to learn the same skills as other youth, only faster and without any support.

Much is known about care leavers in transition. As adults, care leavers are at high risk of unemployment and low educational level, which in turn may result in an increased risk of psychosocial and social problems in adulthood [e.g., 3, 4, 5, for a review see 6]. The outcome of transition in terms of health, risk behavior, work, crime and educational may depend on placement instability, family dysfunction, and emotional and behavioral problems (For reviews see 7, 8, 9, 10, 11). These results are referred to as disappointing [12, 13] or as an attainment gap [14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 11]. The results also attract a lot of attention, and efforts to close the gap are of high priority to the authorities.
There is still a lack of knowledge of what creates these disappointing results, how young people tackle challenges during the transition and how the transition can be facilitated. The group of youth leaving care is very heterogeneous [19, 20], and adolescents’ beliefs about the transition vary, even under different circumstances and at different times of their lives. The youth have to navigate between different institutional pathways. This heterogeneity increases the need to understand the adversity that the young people meet and bring with them. The diversity is well recognized in the research literature. By virtue of the heterogeneity, positive as well as negative stories about the transition can be found. Problems once encountered in childhood may be accentuated [1] or may develop as a cascade and activate other kinds of social and psychological problems [21, 22, 23, 24].

Social support seems to play a major role and the youth’s own stories are a mixture of support from and anger towards their families [20]. Some emphasize [7, 25] that social support and ties to a local community are essential for the well-performed transition. In a meta-synthesis, it was found that social support is crucial for the ease of the transition [25]. The youth face plenty of new tasks and the relationship to others may be the reference point that makes it easier to cope with the transition. The youth fight for social support in a situation where former negative experiences are combined in a movement towards acquisition of new skills. In a narrative review, [7] found that wrong timing of the transition may interrupt the process of synchronizing the youth and the social institutions on their way. A broad range of transition programs has been developed worldwide [26]. Considering the fact that former foster youth have experienced setbacks and rejections during the transition, the question is how life during the transition is attuned to their issues, meaning bringing their past in accord with their current life.

The purpose of this article is to synthesize qualitative studies of transition viewed from the perspective of young people and through this synthesis to identify how the present life of young people is characterized by accumulated memories of the past and fragmented ideas about the future.

2 META-SYNTHESIS

The essence of qualitative research is an in-depth description of the complexity of an experience or a perspective in the context of the setting which the person is embedded in. Qualitative research often uses a variety of concepts, methods and designs, making any kind of generalization across different studies difficult. Meta-synthesis is a method by means of which it is possible to examine, compare and generalize the findings from several qualitative studies. The output from this process is a model of the transition, and this process makes the available knowledge accessible to practitioners.

Research on transition is mainly based on individual-level theorizing, meaning that the main focus is the child in institutional care, leaving the impression that the outcome is only a question of “summing-up” the individual results. Given the heterogeneity, it is a challenge to summarize the results. In 1988, Noblit & Hare [27] suggested metaphors and analogies as a synthesis method to translate qualitative studies and interpret the results. Since then, this synthesis method has been followed by quite a number of methods that prioritize different aspects of the synthesis process [28], for instance, test of key theoretical assumptions [29], aggregation of other researchers’ concepts [30], and interpretive synthesis [31]. Common to them all is the view that meta-synthesis makes it possible to investigate, compare and generalize results from many qualitative studies. A meta-synthesis builds to a greater extent, than does a review, on a stringent multi-phase method of collecting and analysing data; keeping transition studies in mind, this will be commented on below.

2.1.1 Identifying published papers

Studies of out-of-home placement are generally poorly indexed, hence search strategies (and, accordingly, meta-syntheses) are made difficult. A small-mesh net need be cast, afterwards the catch must first be preliminarily sorted and then studied more closely. Owing to the fact that qualitative literature is in general poorly indexed [31] and the literature on out-of-home placement is “messy” as
well, relatively broad criteria have been applied with regard to identification of relevant publications. This required a multi-string search strategy.

The following data bases were searched: PsycInfo and Social Science Citation Index. Using thesaurus, free-text terms and broad text terms, a broad search took place, which was varied according to the facilities (i.e. keywords and applied limits) of the database in question. In addition, the snowball method was applied.

The search strategy was based on the following:

- population, young people in out-of-home placement and in the middle of transition.
- transition, work or education.
- limited to adolescence or young adulthood (between 13 and 29 years of age) and qualitative studies

No attempt has been made to differentiate between different types of placement.

This broad search criteria were chosen as they would likely make more hits than the ones intended. Duplicates were excluded. The search resulted in 1,043 articles and books.

2.1.2 Inclusion and exclusion criteria

All references found were sorted by means of Endnote, peripheral topics were sorted out. This broad search strategy was delimited, and the following topics were excluded: adoption, homelessness, youth crime, correctional institutions, excess weight, sexual problems, psychiatric hospitalization, elderly people, dementia, somatic problems (IPV, hepatitis, HIV), youth placed out of home because of handicap (autism, deafness, intellectual disabilities). Professionals’ perspective on transition were excluded as were articles on supervision, therapy, grant proposals, policy analysis, technical papers on assessment, guides and manuals, statistical indicators. English articles were preferred.

The process resulted in 70 items, prepared for quality assessment.

2.1.3 Quality assessment

Appraising qualitative research is still a relatively new topic on the research agenda. Although no consensus has been reached so far, it is common for the frameworks that they focus on documenting all aspects of the study method, including sampling, auditability, reflexivity, attention to contradictory data, and effective use of theory and prior knowledge. Several criteria has been developed in order to assess the quality of qualitative studies [32, 33, 34]. The most comprehensive framework comes from a study by Spencer [34], which emphasizes 16 different appraisal questions of an assessment process with additional quality indicators for each appraisal question.

These evaluation criteria are answers to questions such as: Does the study have a relevant and important research question? Has the background for this research question been described? Has the methodology been thoroughly accounted for? Does the study provide a convincing analysis of the findings and are they presented in a meaningful way? How useful are the findings in view of existing research?

All 70 items were screened and coded in NVivo and the quality of the qualitative studies was assessed. The first step was to identify and exclude studies that were either quantitative in nature or studies with very interesting but non-empirical reflections on an intervention strategy. Based on quality assessment, several studies were excluded due to lack of sampling strategy and lack of systematic analysis of data. Some articles used citation as an illustration of tendencies from quantitative studies or quantified the qualitative information while others summarized conversations with former foster youth without any documentation or citations. A few studies were interesting and yet rejected in this study because they used the voice of the child to challenge existing child care policy.
After open coding, 30 articles were selected for in-depth analysis. The sample size varied between 3 and 88. All samples were convenience samples or purposive samples. Selection is often unclear, which may influence the findings.

3 DIMENSIONS IN THE LIVED EXPERIENCE OF FORMER FOSTER CARE ADULTS

Being in transition means that the former foster youth are faced with new challenges while they are still concerned about the care history. Descriptive studies have demonstrated very carefully that youth in transition are in a vulnerable situation and need support to cope with the new demands in the transition from dependence to independence. The reports also draw a picture of youth that believe there is a causal connection between their past, present and future, and this will be the focus in the following, which is divided into three parts:

1) first, obstacles that occupies the mind, e.g. disruption of previous plans is related to trauma experiences, desire to be successful was motivated by their past misfortunes, placement breakdowns led to poor grades and drop-out, family disorganization creates distraction, moving away from family was good for them

2) second, ambivalent feelings and conflicts that may accentuate problems in the past, e.g. stigma of being in care and frustration with the system create anger and a wish for involvement in decision-making, lack or loss of social support is tied to aging out, desire of control is related to decisions to leave the system,

3) third, the struggle for their dreams, hopes and ambitions, e.g. disruptions in relationships led to and influenced self-reliance, critical consciousness maintain a positive sense of self, motivation is linked to self-esteem and health, being in care does not affect chances of getting a job or an education

3.1.1 Obstacles – being in care occupies the mind

Being in care seems to create a double ambiguity. First, many placements, breakdowns and reentry into placements as well as stigma and lack of confidence to ‘the system’ often question the meaning of being in care, creating a paradox between working autonomously and following the advice of professionals [35, 36, 37, 38, 39]. “The only person I could trust is myself and my head” [40].

Second, being in care means that the youth feel rejected from their family and friends, and this loss occupies their minds while in care [41, 39]. This has been understood as a survival strategy [35, 40, 42], trying to avoid stigmatization and a wish to hide their origin and struggling against stigma and fear of what the system will do [43]. They feel the label of “being in care” by professionals; as a child with problems. There is no attuning [36]. “My past will of course always be with me” [44].

The double ambiguity occupies their minds and disrupt a link between their actual family situation and their biological family [41]. Young people’s interaction with others during transition varies enormously, quantitatively as well as qualitatively. The youth have mixed experience with social support during transition. Some young people look for help from family and friends whereas others are comprehensively supported [43]. Some young people try to contact family and other young people do not [45]. The contradiction between ideal and real family creates ambiguity [41, 46]. The past and the placement is always under consideration, for some it ended in a positive mode, while others are still severely affected by negativity caused by their parents’ failure to provide a secure upbringing for them [45, 47, 48, 49, 50].

The youth experience many obstacles such as placement instability, negative care and school experiences, poor educational planning, lack of social support, stigma and lack of vocational guidance
which in turn affect their aspirations and achievements in the educational system (cf. later). Quite a few young people identify with other former foster care youth. Young people will often compare themselves with other young people, and their internalization of other people’s perspectives will often be strongly present, e.g., in the form of stigmatization.

Stability during transition seems to compensate for former instability in family and foster care. Opportunities for enhancing job performance will increase the youth’s sense of autonomy and may facilitate transition by means of agency, energy and hard work.

3.1.2 Ambivalent feelings and conflicts that may accentuate the past

Former foster care youth are caught in the middle of different dilemmas or conflicts: first, the conflict between focusing on themselves and exploring possibilities in adult life versus maintaining their ties to their friends. Secondly, the dilemma between their longing for family and models to avoid, and thirdly, the wish to develop autonomy and independence and make their own decisions versus being part of a welfare system. The youth are leaving childhood and not yet in adulthood, and the feeling of being in-between may evoke ambiguity and ambivalent feelings while they are at the same time struggling for independence of the welfare system.

Youth are concerned about housing, work, education, friends etc and at the same time they experience that the care system does not address their worries; this predicament seems to be the context for accentuating former experiences. Their drift for autonomy may be restricted by fewer opportunities than experienced by youth in general; for instance, past experiences interfere with their wish for self-determination. Being dependent of “the system” creates a feeling of lack of control and they are compelled to leave the conflicts of the past and reflect on their own resourcefulness and their future. In addition, inadequate relations, e.g., lack of social support, often implying that others do not interpret or understand their problems. Empirical evidence is found in the youth’s narratives about other people. For some young people it may be a good and necessary strategy to move away from family and break with the past while others are struggling to maintain life through an emerging agency in young adulthood.

The loss of social ties – the separation from family and friends – is accompanied by adversity, ambivalence and strong feelings towards others. Their relationship to the family may be seen as a distraction rather than a supporting relationship. The relationship to other people involves strong feelings. Likewise, social support is a balance between loss of network and building new relations, between longing, belonging and permanence. Ambiguity creates anxiety-provoking situations and transitions often involve setbacks and rejections, which in turn disconnect their knowledge about what to do in a challenging situation. The ambiguity may disconnect the link between situation and coping with the situation.

Doubt arises in young people who experience that adults do not show any interest in them. Fear of failure and of not living up to expectations is what may make transition complicated. A common view in the literature is to look at the transition as a series of small steps towards autonomy, and the regulation of emotions and decisions in the process are affected by experiences and losses that come close to traumas.

On the other hand, however, transition is facilitated if adults show patience, build on the wishes of the young people and attune their reactions to the youth. A decisive factor for a well-performed transition is the ability to be independent of other people’s opinions, to make new friends, to be goal oriented and to accept help when necessary.

Although many groups are involved in providing social support, the crucial aspect is the family, biological as well as foster family or professionals at the institutions. Children and youth in foster care work hard to attune to disappointments experienced in their biological family, the neglect they encountered or the lack of understanding they were met with. Whether or not the child returns to the family, reconciliation is essential.
3.1.3 The struggle for dreams, wishes and aspirations

Having goals motivate young people and barriers for the future is an issue, which comes up frequently [50]. The youth are realistic with regard to balancing between living in the moment and thinking about the future. Different coping strategies will influence their choice: “I try not to think about the future too much because that usually stresses me out” [50]. Young people’s inner dialogue [40] may be concerned with initiative, involvement and dreams about a career whereas the same positive capacities are in some young people mixed with negative emotions that prevail and lead to day-to-day planning.

Many young people wish to have a good career, their ideas are, however, limited or fragmented as to how this career is to be pursued [37, 40]. In general, the youth wish to become involved in decisions regarding own life and, in general, the youth are goal directed [60] and pursue their plans [50]. However, they may need assistance, supervision and sparring in order to make plans in the balance between social ties and pursuing plans [50, 51].

It is not unusual that former foster care youth find assistance to, but also resistance towards, fulfilling their aspirations in role models outside the systems of foster care or education [37, 51, 52, 63]. This kind of assistance may consist of encouraging the youth to carry on as well as finding a balance between their wish to control own life [35]. Goals arise as a contextual driving force [56] in the process between lived experiences and motivation.

4 DISCUSSION

Ambiguity, losses and placement instability seems to have a major impact on the ease of transition [8, 9, 20, 23, 39]. Former foster youth is a heterogeneous group; some are successful during the transition while others still have social or psychological problems. Studies in this synthesis seem to suggest that a successful transition depends on conducive circumstances that makes attuning to the past possible to the youth. The obstacles are placement instability, negative experiences in care and school, stigma and lack of vocational guidance. The transition may, secondly, evoke ambivalent feelings and accentuate the experience of the past and of social ties. The loss of social ties – exclusion from family and friends – is accompanied by adversity, ambivalence and strong feelings towards others. Social ties are about the balance between longing, belonging and permanence. The struggle for an independent life, dreams and aspirations are, thirdly, mixed with negative feelings and beliefs that may occupy their minds and turn the balance between thinking about the future and living in the moment towards the latter. Ambivalence and disruptions are more common than persistence and goal setting. During and after placement in foster care, certain patterns are established, which turn out to be hard to break - a risk trajectory. Out-of-home placement is associated with self-reinforcing processes, which will over time make it difficult to break the risk trajectory, that is, the trajectory from being excluded in childhood to being marginalized in adulthood. The transition is just one – albeit an important one – among many obstacles for children placed in out-of-home care.

Apparently, the transition is gradual and to the youth themselves the transition seems ambiguous. The transition process is understood as a complex, non-linear transaction between person and context [54]. The transition may be perceived as a process where the youth are left to themselves, but at the same time as a process where they discover a new meaning of life. For former foster care youth this may be a process in which they are – often randomly – supported by other people in the educational system or on the labour market. In an attempt to avoid accentuation of early problems, it is essential to provide conducive circumstances in which the youth are able to attune their beliefs to the current situation, for instance, circumstances such as contact on a regular basis and availability, belongingness, reciprocity and accept and acknowledgement [64]. In addition to these qualitative circumstances, it is necessary to align goals of the youth and of others, e.g. caregivers. Attempts at improving the personal goals of the youth show that a close coaching process, during which the young person are taught how to set goals and make plans, does in fact make a difference [65, 66].
4.1.1 Limitations

This metasynthesis reports the results from peer-reviewed articles. Many reports may, however, be published in different languages as local reports. These reports are not included. However, knowing some Danish and English reports these local reports do not change the conclusions.

The majority of transition studies were conducted after the millennium, resulting in a static picture of the transition. However, there is a temporal aspect of transition, meaning that the pattern of transition varies across economic fluctuation, the structure of the labour market and the resulting educational policy. So far, studies are mainly focusing on the youth and their transition. Studies of the larger context for the transition is rare and it could be interesting to elaborate further on the process of attuning to the past.

REFERENCES


Quest, A. Del, Ann Fullerton, Sarah Geenen, and Laurie Powers. "Voices of Youth in Foster Care and Special Education Regarding Their Educational Experiences and Transition to Adulthood." [In English]. Children and Youth Services Review 34, no. 9 (Sep 2012): 1604-15.


---

i PsycInfo implementation: (“foster children” OR “foster care” OR “looked after” OR “looked-after” OR “out of home care” OR “out-of-home care” OR “out of home placement” OR “out-of-home placement” OR “residential care” OR “state care” OR “public care” OR “kinship care” OR “in care” OR “foster home” OR “independent living”) OR (su(“Child welfare” OR “foster children” OR “foster care” OR “child care” OR “Residential care institution” OR “Child abuse” OR “child neglect”))

a PsycInfo implementation: AND su(“school to work transition” OR “educational attainment level” OR “vocational rehabilitation” OR “education” OR “employment” OR Housing OR intervention OR “Academic achievement” OR “Life course” OR “Life Stage Transition” OR “Life changes”)

ii PsycInfo implementation: AND age.exact(“Young Adulthood (18-29 Yrs)” OR “Adolescence (13-17 Yrs)”)) AND qualitative